

Annual Project Review Report

DATE: 15 March 2007

Award ID: 00041585, Project 00047488

Description: Clearing for Results

Implementing Partner: UNDP, with CMAA and CMAC

Period Covered: Year 2006

Author: Steve Munroe, UNDP Project Manager-Clearing for Results

1. Project Issues:

<p>Status of Project Risks & Risk Management Strategy:</p> <p>The risk of delays in the recruitment of key CMAA staff did not materialize. Staff was recruited in time and through a transparent process.</p>	<p>Open Project Issues & Issue Management Strategy:</p> <p>Disbursement of Government contribution to CMAA has been and remains a major issue, due to the important delays experienced in 2006 both for the first and second tranche disbursements. Staff had to wait up to 5 months for the disbursement of their salaries. If this situation persists, CMAA will not be able to attract and retain the qualified staff that it needs in 2007. CMAA successes in 2006 rely heavily on contractual staff and CMAA functioning and credibility would be seriously affected if these staff members decided to leave. It will be essential to improve budget disbursement processes in 2007. This could be done with UNDP support, if Government wishes to request UNDP assistance in this area (to work with CMAA finance staff).</p> <p>Introduction of competitive selection of operators: CMAA and CMAC have both confirmed that they are ready for this evolution. CMAA now has in place a sound accreditation system which will allow the project to distinguish between qualified operators and the ones who don't meet national standards. It is therefore suggested that 2007 be used to 1) design detailed mechanisms for the competitive procurement of mine action services (Quarters 1-2) and 2) upon approval by the board, pilot this competitive process with a portion of the funding, while maintaining some direct funding to CMAC to facilitate a smooth transition.</p>
---	---

2. Project Performance

OUTPUT 1:

Description: Improved mechanism for funding mine clearance that promote efficiency, accountability and the targeting of mine clearance resources on development priorities established at the national, provincial and local levels.

2006 targets: At least US\$ 2 million mobilized in 2006, leading to the clearance of at least 3 square kilometres of priority areas. CMAC work plan targets met. Data available on the portion of cleared land that has effectively been put under productive use. First round of accreditation and licensing completed by CMAA.

2006 Achievements:

The project had total disbursements of over US\$ 4.1 million in 2006, including US\$ 3.45 million directly for mine action operations on the ground. Altogether, 8.7 sq km (8,700,061 sqm) were cleared during 2006 with funding from Clearing for Results, which was substantially higher than the original target. Average clearance is thus circa 40 cents cost per square meter, a very low cost compared to other accredited operators in Cambodia.

Only partial data is available on productive use of cleared land. CMAC reported that 19% of the land cleared was by its quick response teams; the remaining 81% was cleared for specified development purposes. Of the intended land use for areas cleared by CMAC in 2006, the dominant categories were Agriculture (43.1%), Resettlement (11%), mixed Agriculture and Resettlement (21%), Access Roads (15%), Canal/Irrigation (7.4%) and community resources such as schools, pagodas, ponds and others (3%). CMAA has conducted several field investigations but has not yet accumulated enough data to produce an authoritative assessment on this issue. Initial results indicate that only a small portion of minefields (maybe 5%) are not being used at all, but a significant portion are being used differently than initially planned. This is not necessarily a bad thing, as some adjustments may be legitimate and necessary due to changing circumstances, but it is clear that more work and analysis needs to be done in this area. CMAA has recently reinforced its monitoring capacity, with the recruitment of 2 additional socio-economic monitors. Post-clearance monitoring and analysis will be a major focus for the project in 2007.

CMAA successfully completed the first round of accreditation and licensing, with the main three operators obtaining accreditation/licenses and one national company being suspended. The process, lead by CMAA and supported by the UNDP project through the Australian company BACTEC, has been praised by all mine action stakeholders as highly transparent and efficient. A number of international mine action companies have now submitted accreditation requests, and this will be an ongoing task for CMAA. RCAF units coming back from Sudan will also likely apply for accreditation in 2007. CMAA quality assurance capacity will need to be expanded (with additional teams in 2007), in particular to cover the large EOD contracts which will probably be awarded in the Eastern part of Cambodia to prepare the ground for mining companies/ extraction of bauxite in areas with high UXO contamination.

Activity 1:

Deliverable Description for 2006:

Negotiate and supervise CMAC contract. Advise on the feasibility of introducing a competitive approach.

Start and End Date: Throughout year 2006

% Progress to date & narrative explanation:

A first work plan was negotiated and signed with CMAC on 9 February 2006, followed by revisions in May and November 2006 to reflect additional funding received and additional activities. The work plan included support to clearance activities in Banteay Meanchey, Pursat and Battambang provinces for a total of 93 minefields, all approved through the PMAC/MAPU process. In addition, the project also supported CMAC's work in the area of Explosive Ordnance Disposal (EOD), community based risk reduction networks, technical survey and mine risk education. CMAC has exceeded its target at a very low cost for donors (CMAC also benefits from large-scale donations of equipment from the Government of Japan, which allows them to operate at very low cost).

With the CMAA accreditation process now well in place to monitor the quality of operations, and following discussions with CMAA and CMAC officials in November 2006, the project is now ready to take active steps towards the gradual introduction of competitive selection of operators. It is suggested that the first half of 2007 be used by the project manager to draft procedures for this competitive selection process, and present this framework to the project board for review and approval. A portion of funding (maybe 1 or 2 contracts for 500,000\$ each to start with) could be allocated towards the end of 2007 to pilot this competitive selection approach. In 2007, a significant portion of funding will remain allocated to CMAC, in order to facilitate the

transition and avoid serious funding problems in CMAC. This proposed approach has been discussed with CMAA leadership.

How has the gender dimension been addressed: See Activity 5

Activity 2:

Deliverable Description for 2006:

Establish and maintain partnerships with interested donors, ensure adequate reporting and project management

Start and End Date: Throughout year 2006

% Progress to date & narrative explanation:

Agreements have been signed with the Governments of Australia (for 2006) and Canada (2006-2010). UNDP has also maintained a strong partnership with the Adopt-a-Minefield campaign. Additional funds have also been received from the Government of Sweden (for 2006). Advanced negotiations are ongoing with the Spanish Aid Agency (AECI), for a contribution in 2007. Other major mine action donors have also been contacted (US, Japan, Germany), but these donors have long established bilateral mine action programs, and have not expressed interest at this stage to move towards a more coordinated approach, in line with PMAC/MAPU priorities. Total project budget in 2006 (UNDP and donors) was over US\$ 4.1 million, well over the first year target of US\$ 2 million. It is hoped that with continued success of the project, as well as interest from the introduction of a more competitive resource allocation model, will attract enough additional donor support to maintain or exceed the 2006 levels.

Quarterly reports have been provided to all board members, including Government and donor representatives. Reports on specific issues have been provided upon request to both donors and Government.

How has the gender dimension been addressed: See activity 5

Activity 3:

Deliverable Description for 2006:

Develop and implement a Quality Assurance Plan, including milestones for the development of an appropriate CMAA Quality Assurance capacity in the field and for further development of the regulatory framework (Cambodian Mine Action Standards).

Start and End Date: Throughout 2006

% Progress to date & narrative explanation:

This has been a major area of success for the project in 2006. BACTEC company was competitively selected in January 2006 to provide support to CMAA in this area. Their work in collaboration with the CMAA Quality Assurance unit has led to the following results:

- Recruitment by CMAA (through a transparent competitive process) of two quality assurance teams. Team members and team leaders went through an extensive training process (both classroom training and in the field) delivered by BACTEC. Following a final assessment they received official certification as quality assurance officers in September 2006.
- Launch of the first round of accreditation and licensing for mine action operators in Cambodia. Current operators went through a thorough process of desk and field assessment of their procedures, conducted

by CMAA teams. Following a few adjustments required by CMAA, the three main civilian operators (CMAC, MAG, Halo Trust) received official accreditation and licenses in October 2006. One national company was suspended for failing to meet the required standards. Three international companies submitted requests for accreditation in 2006: one has been approved and two are currently being processed by CMAA. CMAA teams have received praise from operators for their professionalism, which puts them in a good position to continue to conduct accreditation and licensing activities on an ongoing basis.

- Six additional Cambodian Mine Action Standards have been drafted by CMAA, discussed with operators and approved in November 2006. These standards cover the issues of protective equipment, clearance requirements (depth etc for both UXO and landmines), and worksite safety. Another 4 standards have been drafted by CMAA to regulate the use of Mine Detection Dogs, and are currently under discussion. CMAA and BACTEC have also issued draft guidelines on environmental issues in Mine Action, for discussion with operators. Cambodia is one of the few affected countries to have developed a coherent set of national standards, based on international standards and reflecting the specificities of mine action work in Cambodia. A final set of standards should be drafted, discussed and approved in 2007.
- CMAA teams have also started their regular monitoring of accredited organizations, through scheduled and un-scheduled field checks. The two existing teams will be deployed to Battambang and Siem Reap respectively, in order to be closer to the operations in the field (deployment in first quarter 2007). It is now becoming clear that CMAA will need to expand this monitoring capacity, to cover not only the 500 minefields cleared every year in Cambodia, but also the growing business of UXO clearance in the Eastern part of the country, which has received a major boost with the allocation of large mining contracts in areas that are highly contaminated by UXOs. This new segment of the mine action sector is very likely to take off in 2007, as reflected by the growing number of accreditation requests that CMAA has received from international commercial companies. It will be crucial to ensure that CMAA expands its monitoring capacity as appropriate to guarantee the quality and safety of mine action operations throughout the country.

How has the gender dimension been addressed: See activity 5

Activity 4:

Deliverable Description for 2006:

Ensure that clearance activities receive funding in time, and are fully in line with the PMAC/MAPU framework

Start and End Date: Throughout year 2006

% Progress to date & narrative explanation:

CMAC has received regular and timely funding from UNDP, upon submission and acceptance of their quarterly progress reports. All CMAC minefields funded by the project have received approval from the PMAC/MAPU. It appears from the few post-clearance monitoring missions conducted in 2006 that there are still some issues with the use of land post-clearance, which doesn't always correspond to initial plans. The CMAA Socio-Economic Department put a lot of emphasis in 2006 on redesigning the PMAC/MAPU planning process in cooperation with Australian Volunteers International (AVI) and PMAC/MAPU staff. In 2007 the focus should shift towards more post-clearance monitoring and analysis of the socio-economic impact of clearance. Minefields cleared in 2006 should be checked for land use in the second half of 2007 (6 months to a year after clearance). More on this issue under activity 5.

How has the gender dimension been addressed: See activity 5

OUTPUT 2:

Description: Strengthened capacities for mine action policy-making, strategy formulation and prioritization of mine clearance tasks in accordance with national and provincial priorities.

2006 Targets: Minefield prioritization procedures issued by CMAA, data available on socio-economic impact of mine clearance, better CMAA communications with ministries and local authorities.

2006 Achievement: CMAA has finalized the new guidelines for the PMAC/MAPU planning process, following extensive consultations over a 9 month period and with support from AVI and the Clearing for Results project. These guidelines are ready for dissemination. Several field visits have been conducted to study the socio-economic impact of mine clearance, and CMAA has been able to liaise with line ministries, the land conflict authority and the office the Prime Minister to solve one prominent land use case in Battambang province. However, due to the heavy focus on the planning process/guidelines in 2006, the post-clearance monitoring work has not been as extensive as anticipated. This will be a major focus for 2007.

Activity 5:

Deliverable Description for 2006:

Improved prioritization/planning methodologies for PMAC, develop tools for CMAA monitoring of land use post clearance, support the development of CMAA annual report on mine action achievements, support CMAA liaison with concerned line ministries, support the development of a CMAA monitoring capacity.

Start and End Date: Throughout 2006

% Progress to date & narrative explanation:

Objectives have been achieved on the planning side with the finalization of the new guidelines for PMAC/MAPU, including clearer instructions on prioritization criteria. The CMAA annual report on mine action achievements was produced in time for the national mine action conference in May 2006, including information on progress made by the various institutions/NGOs, analysis and CMAA recommendations. Tools have also been developed to collect and compile information on post-clearance land use. These tools have been tested during field visits. However, CMAA lacked human resources in 2006 to engage in large-scale post-clearance monitoring. Two additional staff have been selected through a competitive process to become socio-economic monitors. They will be operational in 2007 and collection/analysis of post-clearance information will be a major objective. Several initiatives have been taken to reinforce participation from line ministries in the planning process and in post-clearance activities. Representatives of the land management, agriculture and environment ministries were included in CMAA/PMAC/MAPU trainings, but a more comprehensive strategy remains to be developed to ensure their full involvement and understanding of the mine action planning mechanisms.

How has the gender dimension been addressed: The new national guidelines on PMAC/MAPU have been reviewed by the International Women Development Association (involved in integrated mine action projects in Cambodia and author of the UN guidelines on gender in Mine Action), and a number of amendments have been made to appropriately reflect gender concerns. More sophisticated amendments will be made in the medium term, once the new guidelines have been tested in the field. The measures suggested deal mostly with issues related to the participation and influence of women in decision-making processes traditionally dominated by men. This will ultimately help to ensure that mine action operations (and in particular the ones funded by Clearing for Results) respond to the priorities of both women and men, boys and girls in affected communities.

Activity 6:

Deliverable Description for 2006: Consultancy window to support TWG and/or CMAA needs for independent research, studies, evaluations or policy advice. Promote joint donor initiatives in this regard

Start and End Date: Throughout 2006

% Progress to date & narrative explanation:

This window for consultancy support has been used in 2006 to facilitate the transition between UNDP Technical Assistance to the CMAA database and AVI technical assistance. A consultant was hired for 2 months to help put in place data management standards, as agreed in the database unit work plan, and to help CMAA create a database to record "reclaimed land" (previously suspect land which has been returned to productive by the population without incidents, and therefore no longer be prioritized for clearance). Support to the CMAA database is now a partnership between CMAA (for staffing), AVI (Technical Assistance) and Clearing for Results (performance based incentives for staff and equipment).

How has the gender dimension been addressed: Not specifically addressed

Activity 7:

Deliverable Description for 2006: Performance based management systems introduced in two departments of CMAA (Socio-economic and Regulation/Monitoring). Management advisory support to CMAA leadership.

Start and End Date: Throughout 2006

% Progress to date & narrative explanation:

Progress in this area has been quite satisfactory. 11 CMAA staff in two departments are part of a performance incentive scheme, based on the rates approved by Government and on clear terms of reference. Each has annual objectives defined in the CMAA roadmap. The Quality Assurance Unit has developed a detailed annual work plan and corresponding working procedures. The Socio-Economic department has also produced internal procedures, for a number of its routine activities, with support from the project. The performance of each staff is reviewed on a monthly basis by their CMAA managers, with UNDP oversight. CMAA has put in place a system of bi-weekly Senior Management Team (SMT) meetings chaired by the Secretary General with all Deputy Secretary Generals, Directors of department and UNDP, where attendance is monitored and follow-up actions are systematically recorded. The CMAA budget process has also been monitored throughout the year (see issue in the first section of this report). The project provided strategic support to CMAA for the development of the draft National Strategy on Explosive Remnants of War (ERW).

How has the gender dimension been addressed: Not specifically addressed

3. Lessons Learned

CMAA budget needs to be prepared well in advance and submitted to Ministry of Economy and Finance in order to avoid delays in the payment of salaries. UNDP could assist with the management of counterpart funds and build the capacity of CMAA finance staff if requested by Government.

The experience of having a private company as a sub-contractor to build CMAA Quality Assurance capacity has been a positive one. The company brings in technical credibility and was able to introduce tight management practices in the CMAA QA Unit. The company is held accountable to the milestones specified in the contract, and has been able to flexibly allocate 1 or 2 staff (technical advisors) with complementary skills to ensure that these milestones are met.

4. Financial Report (Attached)
